

RECEIVED

BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION A 11: 47 1 AZ CORP COMMISSION DOCUMENT CONTROL 2 MARC SPITZER Chairman Arizona Corporation Commission 3 JAMES M. IRVIN DOCKETED Commissioner 4 WILLIAM A. MUNDELL MAY 1 2 2003 5 Commissioner JEFF HATCH-MILLER DOCKETED BY 6 Commissioner MIKE GLEASON 7 Commissioner 8 DOCKET NO. T-03889A-02-0796 UTILITIES DIVISION STAFF, T-04125A-02-0796 9 Complainants, 10 VS. 11 LIVEWIRENET OF ARIZONA, LLC, 12 Respondents, 13 14 MOTION TO DISMISS DAVID THE PHONE COMPANY MANAGEMENT STAFFORD JOHNSON GROUP, LLC, 15 Respondents, 16 THE PHONE COMPANY OF ARIZONA JOINT 17 VENTURE d/b/a THE PHONE COMPANY OF 18 ARIZONA, 19 Respondents, 20 ON SYSTEMS TECHNOLOGY, LLC, and its Principles, TIM WETHERALD, FRANK 21 TRICAMO and DAVID STAFFORD 22 **JOHNSON** 23 Respondents, 24 THE PHONE COMPANY OF ARIZONA, LLP, 25 and its members, 26 Respondents.

COMES NOW, David Stafford Johnson ("Johnson"), and pursuant to A.R.S. 12(b)(6) 1 and 56, respectfully moves to dismiss David Stafford Johnson as a Respondent from this action as follows:

- 1. The Staff of the Utilities Division of the Arizona Corporation Commission ("Staff") brought its Complaint ("Complaint") against The Phone Company Management Group, LLC, f/k/a LiveWireNet of Arizona, LLC ("PCMG"), On Systems Technology, LLC ("On Systems"), and its principals, Tim Wetherald, Frank Tricamo, and David Stafford Johnson, on October 21, 2002. The Staff specifically named Johnson as an individual respondent.
- 2. In its Complaint, the Staff questioned the adequacy of PCMG's service to its customers, its compliance with applicable laws, and financial viability, and asserts four claims for relief. See Complaint, ¶¶ 8-45.
- None of these allegations or claims directly implicates Johnson in any way. 3. Instead, the Staff merely identifies Johnson as a member of On Systems. Id. ¶ 7, 12.
- Arizona Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6) provides that a party may assert by motion the defense of failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted. Further, "if matters outside the pleading are presented to and not excluded by the court [on a 12(b)(6) motion], the motion shall be treated as one for summary judgment and disposed of as provide in Rule 56." E.g., Donlann v. MacGurn, 55 P.3d 74, 76 n. 1 (Ariz. App. 2002) (stating that a motion to dismiss that references outside materials is to be treated as a motion for summary judgment).
- 6. Arizona Rule of Civil Procedure 56 provides: "A party against whom a claim, counterclaim, or cross-claim is asserted or a declaratory judgment is sought may, at any time, move with or without supporting affidavits for a summary judgment in the party's favor as to all or any part thereof." E.g., Joel Erik Thompson, Ltd. v. Holder, 965 P.2d 82, 85 n. 3 (Ariz. App. 1998) (noting that if a trial court considers affidavits in support of a motion to dismiss, the court's ruling is treated as a one of summary judgment).

26

25

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- 7. In considering a Rule 12(b)(6) motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim, the court must assume that truth of the allegations contained in the complaint. See B.J. Logan v. Forever Living Products International, Inc., 52 P.3d 760 (Ariz. 2002); see also Parks v. Macro-Dynamics, Inc., 591 P.2d 1005, 1007 (Ariz. App. 1979) ("A Rule 12(b)(6) motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim, which assumes the complaint's allegations are true, attacks the legal sufficiency of the complaint") (citations omitted).
- 8. Here, the allegations in the Complaint, even if taken as true, are not sufficient to support any claim against Johnson because the Staff has failed to allege that he participated in or was aware of any of the events that form the basis of its Complaint. Likewise, the Staff has failed to assert claims upon which Johnson could otherwise be held personally responsible under the Commission's rules. Indeed, Johnson has never been a member of PCMG. <u>Id</u>. at ¶1.
- 9. Although Johnson was a member of On Systems, his role in this entity was extremely limited. Thus, Johnson never participated in the day-to-day operations or management of On Systems, a Colorado limited liability company. See Affidavit of David Stafford Johnson, attached hereto as Exhibit A. Instead, Johnson was merely a member who invested in this limited liability company. <u>Id</u>. at ¶ 2-3.
- 10. Although Johnson was briefly a manager of LiveWireNet of Arizona, LLC ("LiveWireNet of Arizona"), his role in this entity was also very limited, and he never was a member of LiveWireNet of Arizona Id. at ¶¶4-5. Moreover, Johnson's limited activity in this Arizona limited liability company took place before On Systems acquired LiveWireNet of Arizona on January 29, 2002. Significantly, Johnson resigned his position with LiveWireNet of Arizona upon the sale of LiveWireNet of Arizona to On Systems.
- 11. Given that Johnson has neither participated in nor is aware of the events that give rise to this action (Id. at ¶6), and the fact that the Staff has failed to allege facts that support any claim against him in this proceeding, the Staff's Complaint is insufficient as to Johnson.

1	WHEREFORE, pursuant to A.R.S 12(b)(6) and 56, Mr. Johnson respectfully requests
2	that he be dismissed from this action.
3	
4	DATED this 7th day of May 2003.
5	Respectfully submitted,
6	
7	DAVID STAFFORD JOHNSON
8	
9	By:
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21 22	
23	
24	
25	
20	

1	ORIGINAL and 13 copies of the foregoing			
2	sent via U.S. Mail, postage prepaid, this 7th day of May, 2003 to:			
3	Docket Control			
4	ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION			
5	1200 West Washington Street Phoenix, AZ 85007			
6				
7	COPY of the foregoing sent via U.S. mail, postage prepaid, this day of May, 2003:			
8	Mauroon A. Saott Egg			
9	Maureen A. Scott, Esq. Legal Division			
10	ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION 1200 West Washington Street			
11	Phoenix, AZ 85007			
12	Christopher Kempley, Chief Counsel			
13	Legal Division ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION			
14	1200 West Washington Street Phoenix, AZ 85007			
15	Lyn Farmer, Chief Hearing Officer			
16	Hearing Division ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION			
17				
18	Phoenix, AZ 85007			
19	Ernest Johnson, Director Utilities Division			
20	ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION			
21	1200 West Washington Street Phoenix, AZ 85007			
22				
23	Tim Wetherald On Systems Technology, LLC 3025 S. Parker Road, Suite 1000 The Phone Company of Arizona Joint Venture			
24	Aurora, CO 80014 The Phone Company of Arizona, LLP The Phone Company Management Group, LLC			
25	d/b/a The Phone Company Management Group, LLC			

1 2	Theresa Dwyer FENNEMORE CRAIG	Qwest Corporation
3	3003 N. Central Avenue, Suite 2600 Phoenix, AZ 85003-2913	
4	Mark Brown	Qwest Corporation
5 6	QWEST CORPORATION 3033 N. 3rd Street, Suite 1009	
7	Phoenix, AZ 85012	The Diene Communication
8	Jeffrey Crockett SNELL & WILMER	The Phone Company of Arizona
9	One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren	
10	Phoenix, AZ 85004	
11	Michael L. Glaser, Esq. Shughart Thomson & Kilroy, P.C.	
12	1050 17th Avenue, Suite 2300 Denver, CO 80265	
13		
14		David Stafford Johnson
15 16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		

1	BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPO	ORATION COMMISSION
2 3 4 5 6 7	MARC SPITZER Chairman JAMES M. IRVIN Commissioner WILLIAM A. MUNDELL Commissioner JEFF HATCH-MILLER Commissioner MIKE GLEASON Commissioner	
8	UTILITIES DIVISION STAFF,	DOCKET NO. T-03889A-02-0796 T-04125A-02-0796
10	Complainants,	1-04123/1 02 0770
11	VS.	
12	LIVEWIRENET OF ARIZONA, LLC,	
13	Respondents,	
14 15	THE PHONE COMPANY MANAGEMENT GROUP, LLC,	AFFIDAVIT OF DAVID STAFFORD JOHNSON
16	Respondents,	
17 18	THE PHONE COMPANY OF ARIZONA JOINT VENTURE d/b/a THE PHONE COMPANY OF ARIZONA,	
19	Respondents,	
202122	ON SYSTEMS TECHNOLOGY, LLC, and its Principles, TIM WETHERALD, FRANK TRICAMO and DAVID STAFFORD	
23	JOHNSON Respondents	
24 25	Respondents, THE PHONE COMPANY OF ARIZONA, LLP, and its members,	
26	Respondents.	l

. .

•

1 | 2 | 3 |

5

The Affiant, David Stafford Johnson, being first duly sworn, deposes and states that he is over twenty-one years of age and if called upon to testify, he is competent to testify as to the matters stated as follows:

- 1. I have never been a member of The Phone Company Management Group, LLC, an Arizona limited liability company. I have never visited this limited liability company's offices in Arizona. I have never maintained an office at this limited liability company. I have never been involved in the management or day-to-day operations of this limited liability company. Since the name change from LiveWireNet of Arizona, LLC to The Phone Company Management Group, LLC in late January, 2002, I have never been a manager of the company and at all times never held myself out to the public as a manager of this company.
- 2. Although I was a member of On Systems Technology, LLC, a Colorado limited liability company, from January 1, 2002 through August 7, 2002, I never participated in the day-to-day operations or management of this Colorado limited liability company. I have never been a manager of the company and never held myself out to the public as a manager of this company.
- 3. My membership with On Systems Technology, LLC, was solely based on my investment in this company.
- 4. Although I was a representative of LiveWireNet of Arizona, LLC beginning when it was formed as a subsidiary to Live Wire Networks, Inc.; I resigned my position when On Systems Technology purchased LiveWireNet on January 29, 2002. I have never been a member of LiveWireNet of Arizona, LLC.
- 5. My association with LiveWireNet of Arizona, LLC, was based on my financial investment in its parent, Live Wire Networks, Inc.. LiveWireNet of Arizona, LLC did not ever commence offering telecommunications services in Arizona.
- 6. I did not participate in, and I do not otherwise have knowledge regarding the facts or claims alleged by Staff in the above-captioned action.

1	The foregoing statements are true and correct to my personal knowledge.
2	
3	Dayed Stafford Johnson
4	Title: Individual
5	
6	STATE OF <u>Colorado</u>) ss. COUNTY OF <u>Frapahoe</u>)
7	COUNTY OF Franch (2)
8	,
9	SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN to before me thisday of May 2003.
10	My commission expires: My Commission Expires
11	3/5/2006
12	(SEAL)
13	- We have
14	Notary Public
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	